

Devolved Government in Northern Ireland



ALAN WHYSALL

**HONORARY SENIOR RESEARCH ASSOCIATE
CONSTITUTION UNIT
UNIVERSITY COLLEGE LONDON**

**<http://www.ucl.ac.uk/constitution-unit/people/honorary/alan-whysall>
or search 'Alan Whysall UCL'**

27 June 2019

Outline



- Timeline: how we got to devolved government under the Good Friday Agreement 1998
- The institutions...
- How they operated...
- How we lost them...

The fundamentals of NI politics



- Religious division in Ireland; partition, 1921...
- Politics – and society – fractured between **unionism** and **nationalism**
 - Northern Ireland constructed to have a unionist majority
 - The four largest parties (DUP, Sinn Féin, UUP, SDLP) self-designate as either unionist or nationalist
 - Accounting for 85-90% of votes – until 2019
- Corresponding to a large degree with religious affiliation and identity...
- And to some degree with a wish for a united Ireland
- The old majority is now disappearing, as we'll see
- And identities becoming more flexible...
- But still a profound social fracture, starting to heal in recent years, now in danger of worsening

End of the old regime, search for a new start



- 1921 to 1972: Government of Ireland Act, ‘Westminster model’ – one-party **majority rule** at Stormont...
- Ever entrenching divisions, North and South
- Late 1960s: Civil Rights movement...
- But also terrorism, on both sides, for 25 years
- 1972: **Direct Rule** and a **Secretary of State**
- 1973 **Sunningdale** agreement, **power-sharing** government and an **“Irish Dimension”**
- ... collapsed, pursuit of powersharing continued
- 1981: Hunger strikes, and Sinn Féin in politics
- 1985: **Anglo Irish Agreement**, and an **Irish role** in non-devolved affairs

New realities: ceasefires and talks



- 1991-2: talks with the ‘constitutional’ parties but also...
- Hume-Adams dialogue and backchannel to SF
- 1993: the Downing St Declaration: consent to unity
- 1994: Ceasefires... And the problem of **decommissioning**
- 1996: Report of **US** Senator Mitchell... route into talks based on ‘democratic and exclusively peaceful means of resolving political issues... total disarmament of all paramilitary organisations’
- 1996: Talks begin (and IRA ceasefire ends)
- 1997: IRA ceasefire resumes, Sinn Fein into talks, and the DUP leave
- 1998 (April): the **Good Friday or Belfast Agreement**... referendums (71.1% pro in Northern Ireland, 94.4% in South)

What gave us the Good Friday Agreement?



- 25 years of undoing division...
- Governments in London committed to the peace process, with bipartisan support at Westminster
- Working fully in partnership with Irish governments
- With some civil society support
- ... Against the prevailing fatalism
- Paramilitaries concluding that they could not win

Good Friday/Belfast Agreement 1998



- Not just **power-sharing government** (Strand One)...
- Constitutional status... Northern Ireland in UK or Ireland, by consent, in a **border poll**. Legal changes
- **North-South** institutions (Strand Two) and encouragement for cooperation; and
- **East-West** (Strand Three)
- **Parity of esteem; rights and equality**
- Transition from conflict: prisoner releases, decommissioning, reconciliation and victims
- Later: policing - the Patten reforms and Policing Board

Devolution: the Assembly



- About (political) diversity, powersharing, minority protection; resolving a political standoff, not administrative efficacy
- 90 members (reduced from 108), elected by **STV**
- Responsible for economic and social issues, law and order (not defence, foreign relations, macroeconomy).
- Not technically federal – but the **Sewel convention**
- Subject to EU law and European Rights Convention
- **MLAs** – designate as Unionist, Nationalist, or other
- Key votes need **cross community support** (50, 50, 50; or 60, 40, 40); 30 members signing a **Petition of Concern** > cross community vote

Devolution: the Executive



- **First Minister and deputy First Minister**, one Nationalist, one Unionist, all powers joint and equal
- Ministers: selection by the **d'Hondt** formula: any party sufficiently large entitled to nominate ministers, and only parties can dismiss them
- Exception: Justice Minister: election by cross community vote
- All parties used to take up d'Hondt places; latterly some chose Opposition

[Devolution: money]



- Power to raise local property taxes (rates)
- But nearly all money to/from the Treasury: mainly the Barnett formula (existing budgets, +/- increase or decrease in comparable Whitehall budgets)
- NI fiscal deficit of £9.6 billion on total spending of 23.8 billion (2011-12)
- Northern Ireland public expenditure per head 27% higher than England

The Agreement ... eventually implemented



- 1999 (December): devolution of economic and social matters, with David Trimble (UUP) and Seamus Mallon (SDLP) as FM/DFM...
- Continuing Unionist concern about IRA activity (despite first act of decommissioning, 2001)
- 2002: collapse of devolution and resumed direct rule
- 2003: new elections: DUP and Sinn Fein on top
- 2005: IRA statement – “end to the armed campaign... dump arms... exclusively peaceful means... an alternative way to end British rule in our country”
- 2006-7: **St Andrews Agreement**... devolution resumed
- 2010: **Hillsborough Castle Agreement**: devolution of policing and justice
- 2010 to 2012: partnership... reconciliation... the Queen... and Sinn Fein

2012 on... the structures shaken



- 2012: tensions over parades... The flags dispute
- 2013: efforts at refocusing... the Economic Pact; Together-Building a United Community
- 2013: the Haass talks: flags, parades, **legacy** issues
- 2014: Euro-elections... welfare and parades...
- December 2014: the **Stormont House Agreement** (finance, welfare, flags, legacy, parades, institutions)
- February 2015: Sinn Féin 'misled... DUP bad faith'
- Summer 2015: paramilitary concerns
- November 2015: '**Fresh Start**'
- May 2016: Assembly elections: Arlene Foster, First Minister
- [Remarkable increase in women in Northern Ireland politics]

Sudden collapse, January 2017



- **McGuinness resigns as DFM, 9 January. Why?**
 - **Renewable Heat Incentive** scandal... the latest whiff of corruption
 - ‘Disrespect’, identity, language, equality...
 - **Brexit** – a factor for mistrust
 - Illness and death of Martin McGuinness
- **Assembly election, March 2017**
 - Polarisation: DUP down, SF up... [DUP 28, SF 27, SDLP 12, UUP 10, All 8]. No overall unionist majority of seats
- **General election, June 2017**
 - More polarisation: DUP and SF do well, others badly; no nationalist representation in Parliament
 - **DUP-Conservative confidence and supply arrangement:** further damage to British Government’s standing as broker
- **Talks: the near-deal of February 2018**

No government, the settlement falling apart...



- Civil servants in charge but without legitimacy
- Their legal authority challenged, pinned up by Westminster
- Members of the Assembly not meeting, but paid
- A widening divide...
- Fractures in the settlement on policing

Prospects for finding a way through



- Appetite for early resolution limited for the last year-
 - Brexit:
 - ✦ Split between DUP and other parties
 - ✦ British and Irish governments at loggerheads
 - ✦ London unfocused on Northern Ireland, except its DUP alliance
 - ✦ Prospect of hard Brexit – it could all get much worse
 - Renewable heat incentive
 - ✦ Inquiry to report in September
- But then this Spring-
 - Death of Lyra McKee: political vacuums favour terrorism
 - Local/Euro election results: voters looking for something different
- So we are in talks...

[Positives of the devolved system...



- Constitutional pathway firmly established
- Sectarian division in politics accommodated
- Institutions of government largely accepted, including police, remarkably
- Old adversaries working together
- Steps towards reconciliation
- Most street violence ended
- Competent, honest public services delivered

... and negatives]



- Never had stable government for sustained period
- Little common purpose or ‘vision’
- Focus on past not future: reconciliation was limited
- Fragmenting consensus? – parties increasingly focused on other things than working together: Unionists their hardliners, Sinn Fein the South... commitment issues
- Easily hamstrung: decisions not made
- Politics not policy: bad at ‘government’... Despite real challenges on the economy, shared future, public services
- Little public policy innovation or challenge
- Little civil society voice
- Suspicion of corruption, certainly clientelism

Alternatives



- **Direct rule**
 - Legitimacy would be challenged
 - Where does it lead in the long term?
- **New arrangements/institutional change?**
 - But what is achievable?
- **Border poll – a United Ireland**
 - A 50% plus one vote? But no process, no plan, prospects of chaos
- **Change from within Northern Ireland society**
 - Outsiders lack the capacity and interest
 - New voices, changing the climate
 - Vision
 - Public policy challenge and development – think tanks etc

Conclusion



- The Agreement not a complete answer
- But the right direction: pluralist -- borders, exclusive identity, mattered less
- Highly imperfect, certainly as "good government", but less imperfect than anything for a hundred years
- Not clear we could have done anything better
- Now in danger of losing the progress we've made